MONITORING & EVALUATION (M&E)
TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE FOR A GLIMMER OF HOPE FOUNDATION

Guidance regarding target populations and interventions

Ashweeta Patnaik
Heath Prince

June 2018
This report was prepared with funds provided from The Glimmer of Hope Foundation (UTA contract number: 44179) to the Ray Marshall Center for the Study of Human Resources at the University of Texas at Austin. The views expressed here are those of the authors and do not represent the positions of the funding agencies or The University.
INTRODUCTION
OVERVIEW

In 2000, A Glimmer of Hope Foundation (Glimmer) was founded with the mission to improve lives in Ethiopia. With an endowment to fund all operations, Glimmer was established with the promise that all donor funds would go directly to projects in the field. Glimmer employs a full staff of Ethiopian development experts and works with indigenous development partners to address the systemic needs of the Ethiopian people through an integrated approach.

Glimmer believes that ending entrenched poverty takes more than one school or one well; instead, it takes a holistic approach that creates a network of resilience. A small loan for one woman boosts an entire village’s economy. Education sets a girl on a path to change the course of her life. The birth of a healthy baby starts to break the cycle of poverty. Glimmer’s holistic approach gets to the roots of poverty. With the power of its integrated projects, Glimmer can delay the age of marriage for girls, support safer pregnancies and healthier babies, and foster thriving village economies.

To create the greatest impact, Glimmer invests in village communities for five years, aligns with the government’s priorities, and engages community members as partners in its work. It focuses on four lifesaving services that hold up a community and build resilience; clean water, education, health care, and livelihoods projects are prioritized to create the deepest impact in each community. Project plans are customized to the critical needs and natural resource opportunities in each new community.

Glimmer is committed to monitoring its work and constantly learning, applying its findings and sharing its work with the world. The Ray Marshall Center (RMC), an organized research unit in the LBJ School of Public Affairs at The University of Texas, is providing technical assistance to support Glimmer’s monitoring and evaluation (M&E) efforts. The RMC’s experience and expertise supports Glimmer’s work by demonstrating the effectiveness and robustness of its integrated approach to addressing poverty.

The RMC has been at the forefront of pro-poor education, workforce, and social policy research since its creation in 1970. The RMC identifies and fosters creative solutions to challenging problems through a variety of applied research activities, including policy research analysis, state-level consulting on capacity development, program monitoring and evaluation, and impact evaluations, using both quantitative and qualitative methods.

In this second phase of technical assistance, the RMC conducted an in-depth review of literature to understand the primary factors driving poverty in Ethiopia; interventions currently being implemented to address factors driving poverty in Ethiopia; specific interventions that have been shown to be most effective; and, interventions, issues, and target populations that other actors (government/NGOs) are addressing in the area and their effectiveness. In this report, we provide strategic advice and recommendations on selection of appropriate target populations and appropriate target interventions for Glimmer’s interventions (specifically in the livelihoods and education sectors).
ETHIOPIA CONTEXT

Geography

Ethiopia is located in East Africa and bordered by Eritrea, Somalia, Kenya and Sudan. The country’s total land area is about 1.1 million square km, with a population density of 86 people per square km. Ethiopia is one of the least urbanised countries in the world, with only an estimated 20% of its population living in urban areas.

Economy

The country’s economy is primarily agriculture-based. Agricultural production is the source of livelihood for a great majority of the population - more than 70% of Ethiopia’s population is employed in the agricultural sector. But services and industry sectors have recently surpassed agriculture as the principal source of GDP.

Demographics

The country is home to a population of about 104 million and is the second most populous country in Africa. Ethiopia has an annual population growth rate of 2.4%. Forty-four percent of the population is below the age of 15 and the fertility rate is over 5 children per woman (and even higher in rural areas).

The rapid population growth is putting increasing pressure on land resources, expanding environmental degradation, and raising vulnerability to food shortages.

Factors driving poverty

In 2000, Ethiopia had one of the highest poverty rates in the world, with 44 percent of the population living below the national poverty line and 56 percent of the population living on less than United States (U.S.) $1.25 purchasing power parity (PPP) a day. In the previous five years (1996-2000), little progress had been made in reducing poverty.

However, since 2000, Ethiopia has experienced remarkable progress in reducing income poverty. In 2011, only 30 percent of the population was living below the national poverty line and only 31 percent of the population was living on less than United States (U.S.) $1.25 purchasing power parity (PPP) a day. The World Bank Group’s 2014 Ethiopia Poverty Assessment found that reductions in poverty were driven by strong agricultural growth, improvements in basic services, and effective rural safety nets.

Despite progress toward eliminating extreme poverty, Ethiopia remains one of the poorest countries in the world. Based on the United Nations Development Programme’s Human Development Index, Ethiopia ranks 174th out of 187 countries. While Ethiopia has the lowest level of income-inequality in Africa and one of the lowest in the world, measures of inequality that give more weight to poorer households show that national inequality steadily increased from 2000 to 2011. Geography still matters; those who live in more remote locations are consistently poorer than those living in closer proximity to markets and services. Almost half of rural households in Ethiopia were affected by
drought from 1999 to 2004 and drought had a significant impact on the welfare of these households. In 2015-16, changes in rainfall resulted in the worst drought in 30 years, creating food insecurity for millions of Ethiopians. Crop and livestock productivity is plagued by erratic rainfall, crop and livestock diseases, poor infrastructure, limited access to markets, and lack of skilled human resources.

The World Bank Group finds that further investment in basic services are required to ensure that Ethiopia continues to make additional, needed, progress in education, health and living standards. Continued emphasis on the successful delivery of basic services in rural areas is required, as well as further attention to the needs of urban households, for which progress has been slower.

The following examines two critical components of well-being in Ethiopia, education and livelihoods, with an aim toward identifying potential implementable interventions by GoE.
EDUCATION
CURRENT STATE OF EDUCATION IN ETHIOPIA

Ethiopia has shown substantial progress on education measures in recent decades. The World Bank’s “World Development Indicators” (WDI) data show that adult literacy rates have increased from 34 percent in 1994 to 55 percent in 2007. Lower secondary school completion rates have risen from 19 percent in 2005 to 59 percent in 2015. The proportion of households with a child between the ages of seven and 15 that had a child out of school fell from 83 percent in rural areas and 26 percent in urban areas in 2000 to 58 percent in rural areas and 16 percent in urban areas in 2011. Enrollment rates for primary education increased from 30 percent in 2000 to 62 percent in 2011. As a result, the share of the population between 15 and 24 years old able to read at least part of a sentence increased five-fold from 8 percent to 36 percent, the share of the population aged six years and over with no education declined from 69 percent to 46 percent, and the average years of schooling of this population increased from 4.0 to 4.5 years.

The challenge for Ethiopia is increasing attendance rates at higher grades and ensuring that the quality of education received is adequate.

Enrollment

The numbers of children with access to basic education in sub-Saharan Africa have increased substantially over the last two decades. However, enrolments by grade have not grown as anticipated in a number of sub-Saharan African countries. Massive gains in enrolment in Grade 1 have not been matched by similar increases in higher grades in subsequent years. According to the 2016 Ethiopia Demographic and Health survey, the gross enrollment ratio for primary school was 91 percent, but dropped to 30 percent for secondary. According to the 2017/18 Global Education Monitoring (GEM) Report, in Ethiopia in 2014, the primary education completion rate was only 40 percent and drops to 16 percent for lower secondary and 12 percent for upper secondary. This is of considerable concern since, despite expansion, it means that many children still fail to complete a full cycle of basic education.

According to UNESCO Institute for Statistics (UIS) data, of the 61 million out-of-school children in 2014, more than half (34 million) live in sub-Saharan Africa. Ethiopia was one of six countries that were home to more than one third of all out-of-school children in 2014. According to the Education Policy and Data Center (EPDC), in Ethiopia in 2016, 25 percent of primary children aged 7-14 were out of school, while 50 percent of secondary youth aged 15 to 18 were out of school. The high rate of out-of-school upper secondary youth in sub-Saharan Africa was the highest proportion for any region worldwide. Youth who could be fine-tuning the skills they need for the job market or progressing to tertiary education are not even in the classroom.

The range of children’s ages within grades also remains wide in many sub-Saharan African countries. According to the Education Policy and Data Center (EPDC), in Ethiopia in 2016, 46 percent of pupils are over-age for their grade in primary school while 45 percent are over-age in secondary school. But national curricula and pedagogy in sub-Saharan African countries remain essentially monograde in their assumptions. Thus, wide age-in-grade ranges are likely to disadvantage the already disadvantaged and lead to dropout before completion.

Early literacy

Just over half (55 percent) of Ethiopia’s population is literate, defined as individuals age 15 and over who can read and write. An Early Grade Reading
Assessment (EGRA) funded by USAID and conducted in Grades 2 and 3 in 2010 found that 34% of students in Grade 2 were unable to read a single word of a grade-level relevant story; 48% of students were unable to answer a single comprehension question on a reading comprehension test; and only 5% of students were able to reach 60 words per minute in reading fluency.

Poor basic skills acquisition in the early grades prevents children from learning effectively in their mother tongue, in Amharic and in English, affecting all subsequent levels of education and impacting skills acquisition in other subjects. Reading is a fundamental skill for all learning and allows children to learn math, science and other subjects. The ability to read also improves health and well-being of individuals and families, opens up employment opportunities, and mitigates the chances that youth will pursue criminal or violent activities.

Gender gap

Although the primary school enrollment rate of girls in Ethiopia has increased in the last three decades, the majority are unable to transition to secondary and tertiary school due to distance, personal security and economic challenges. As girls grow older, academic participation becomes increasingly difficult as it takes time away from essential income generating activities. According to the Education Policy and Data Center (EPDC), in 2016, 55 percent of secondary girls aged 15 to 18 were out of school, compared to 46 percent of secondary boys aged 15 to 18. According to the 2016 Ethiopia Demographic and Health survey, 48 percent of women age 15-49 have no formal education, compared to 28 percent of men age 15-49. The median years of schooling was 3.9 years for men aged 15-49, compared to just 0.6 years for women aged 15-49. While 69 percent of men aged 15-49 are literate, only 42 percent of women aged 15-49 are literate.

School environments

According to the 2017/18 Global Education Monitoring (GEM) Report, in Ethiopia in 2014, 40 percent of schools had basic drinking water; 77 percent of schools had basic sanitation or toilets, of which 41 percent were single-sex toilets; and, 7 percent of schools had basic handwashing facilities.

CURRENT GLIMMER STRATEGY

Glimmer’s education strategy has largely focused on physical infrastructure and funding the building and renovations of schools. In recent years, Glimmer has also supported teacher training and Girls Clubs.

CURRENT EDUCATION INTERVENTIONS IN ETHIOPIA

Ethiopia Accelerated School Readiness program

The Government of Ethiopia is searching for an affordable model to increase school readiness that can serve as an alternative to providing a costly nine-month preprimary education. With support from UNICEF, the Government has designed the Ethiopia Accelerated School Readiness program to pilot two models for improving learning for young children.

- The first model will provide support to children during the summer break before they start first grade and will pay a stipend to teachers who agree to teach the summer program.
- In the second model, children will receive the school readiness support during their first two months of first grade term. After the program is
completed, the teacher will teach a condensed version of the regular first grade curriculum to make up for the time spent on improving school readiness.

The evaluation of this program will provide evidence on the relative effectiveness of two school readiness programs, which the Government of Ethiopia will use in their decision on expanding the program throughout the country.

**Education Sector Development Program V (ESDP V)**

Ethiopia developed a sector plan for 2015/16 to 2019/20. The Education Sector Development Program V (ESDP V) is guided by the vision to maintain the momentum of expanding equitable access to quality general education, establish technical and vocational education and training institutes in all woredas, strengthen tertiary education institutions and provide lifelong learning opportunities so that all can contribute and benefit from rapid growth and economic change in Ethiopia.

**Girls clubs**

Girls’ clubs are established with the aim of preventing and mitigating school based and community based barriers to girls’ education. The clubs aim to empower girls and focus on engaging girls between 5th-8th grades. The girls clubs provide hygiene kits; provide education on hygiene and menstruation; provide information on sexual and reproductive health; provide information on protection from harmful traditional practices such as child marriage and female genital mutilation; and, provide a space for open discussion. The girls’ clubs are often coed.

For more than 20 years, USAID’s activities in Ethiopia have addressed a variety of needs related to access, equity, quality, and relevance, accomplished in close partnership with the Ministry of Education and regional state education bureaus. Quality of education remains the biggest challenge and priority facing the Ethiopian education system. Major activities supported by USAID in Ethiopia include:

- Improving the reading and writing skills of students in primary schools, with an increasing focus on vulnerable populations and traditionally underserved communities
- Developing national curriculum in English and local languages
- Providing quality materials to support instruction and out-of-school activities
- Improving the professional capacity of 1st through 8th grade teachers
- Improving the planning and management capacity of the primary education system at national, regional, district, and community levels
- Strengthening parental and community involvement

Major programs supported by USAID include:

- **Reading for Ethiopia’s Achievement Developed - Technical Assistance** focuses on establishing a firm foundation for high-quality teaching and learning. It trains teachers and develops curriculum and associated teaching and learning materials in
order to improve reading in primary schools.

- **Reading for Ethiopia’s Achievement Developed**—Community Outreach increases access to appropriate reading materials; provides children with additional and much needed opportunities to practice reading at home, in the larger community and in schools; and strengthens parental and community support for reading while increasing the capacity of Ministry of Education and regional state education bureaus through joint implementation.

- **Reading for Ethiopia’s Achievement Developed**—Monitoring and Evaluation (READ M&E) is designed to foster effective use of assessment tools, testing methodology, and the data they generate, to improve early-grade reading and writing, and ultimately student learning.

---

The World Bank

The World Bank helps support the General Education Quality Improvement Project (GEQIP) which is helping to improve the quality of teaching and learning conditions in 40,000 primary and secondary schools across the country. The project provides annual school grants for school improvement programs and supports new policies on curriculum, teacher training, teacher licensing, school inspection and assessment of student learning.

The Hunger Project

The Hunger Project works to build sustainable community-based programs using the Epicenter Strategy. Through the Epicenter Strategy, 15,000-25,000 people are brought together as a cluster of rural villages, giving villages more clout with local government than a single village is likely to have while also increasing a community’s ability to collectively utilize resources poverty. The Hunger Project – Ethiopia is comprised of eight epicenters in five districts in Oromiya, Southern Nations, Nationalities and People’s Region and Amhara regional states. Epicenter communities operate a preschool for young children, often providing their only nutritious meal per day. Five of the six epicenters offer literacy classes, taught in the local languages.

**Save the Children**

Save the Children’s Literacy Boost program focuses on increasing literacy levels of children to a grade 2 level before they reach secondary school. Literacy Boost works within communities to strengthen child literacy by developing five core reading skills: letter knowledge, phonemic awareness, vocabulary, reading fluency and comprehension. The program functions alongside national public school curriculum and local languages to improve learning outcomes for primary-aged children in and out of school. The program’s three-pronged approach involves reading assessments, teacher training and community action. Specifically in Ethiopia, Literacy Boost students show 2.5 times more progress in reading words than non-Literacy Boost students.

Nuru International

Nuru Ethiopia has partnered with Save the Children
to implement **Literacy Boost** in order to increase literacy levels of children in rural farmer households to a grade 2 level before they reach secondary school. Nuru Ethiopia is implementing the teacher training and community action components of Literacy Boost for children in and out of schools who are a part of families in Nuru farmer cooperatives in Boreda Woreda, a rural region in the Gamo Gofa Zone of southwest Ethiopia.

**Ethiopia Reads**

Ethiopia Reads collaborates with communities to plant libraries, train educators, boost literacy, and provide youth and families with the tools to improve their lives. Since 1998, Ethiopia Reads has built five schools, planted 72 libraries, and now annually serves over 130,000 children. In rural areas, its horse-powered literacy program reaches children with no access to schools. Ethiopia Reads supports professional development year-round with workshops, discussion circles, mentoring, and program evaluation.

**World Vision Ethiopia (WVE) Education and Life Skills Program**

World Vision Ethiopia (WVE)’s Education and Life Skills Program aspires to ensure all children, especially the most disadvantaged and vulnerable, experience learning and gain a reliable education with minimum global standards. Activities include:

- Conduct regular parenting empowerment sessions to enhance parents’ capacity to nurture their children’s holistic development;
- Establish community managed, cost-effective and quality early learning centers;
- Capacitate facilitators, community representatives, and Woreda education officers about the quality ECD programming;
- Conduct baseline and end-line assessments for children's reading levels;
- Train teachers on how to help their students learn to read at school;
- Establish village based reading camps;
- Supply age-appropriate, culturally relevant reading materials to the reading camp children;
- Engage the community parents to help their children in reading at home;
- Improve teachers’ professional competency;
- Create safe learning environment;
- Empower school leadership and management, and increase stakeholders’ engagement in children’s learning;
- Engage education stakeholders to ensure the enrolment of all children;
- Improve “life skills” for adolescents and youth; and
- Empower youth through business skills, life skills training, and financial literacy.
BEST PRACTICES FROM LITERATURE

Early-grade literacy/numeracy interventions

Research has shown that reading interventions with a phonological/phonic basis are effective. Some examples include the Reading to Learn (RTL) intervention implemented by the Aga Khan Foundation (AKF), the Primary Maths and Reading Initiative (PRIMR) in Kenya, and the Literacy Boost program implemented by Save the Children.

Studies have also found that simply delivering textbooks and instructional materials to classrooms produces no achievement gains. However, deliberate efforts to improve the quality of instruction—by combining quality materials and supporting teachers in the effective use of these through professional development—can yield gains. Research also suggests that teacher preparation for early grades teaching should include skills to support reading for meaning and concept learning about numbers. Research also highlights the importance of reading materials in the local language.

Overall, the literature suggests that effective early-grade literacy/numeracy programs include teacher training on reading/math instruction; provision of teaching and learning materials; the production of reading materials in the local language; more active, student-focused approaches; the use of assessments; well targeted instructional interventions; increased instructional time; and, community support for children’s reading.

Preschool enrichment programs

Effective preschool programs prepare children for primary school by helping them develop basic academic, cognitive, and behavioral skills critical for learning. Research has shown that preschool enrichment programs can have an impact on foundation learning and emergent literacy skills. But, in low-income countries it can be challenging for governments to provide formal, comprehensive preprimary education to all children. While programs and services are growing in numbers, the quality of these programs and equity of access is far less certain. In Ethiopia, private pre-schools have to some extent filled an early childhood education vacuum, but for the most part they benefit only the most advantaged urban groups. According to the 2017/18 Global Education Monitoring (GEM) Report, in Ethiopia in 2015, the gross enrolment ratio (GER) in pre-primary education and early childhood educational development was only 30 percent.

Early educations services are also of variable quality. Better coordination of transitions between pre-school and primary classes is needed. It is important to train teachers on a particular early childhood development model and provide teaching materials and tools to support early literacy and math skill development.

School resources

Research has shown that school resources are important determinants of the rural-urban gaps in students’ literacy. Resources include the conditions of school buildings, the number of school facilities and equipment, the number of instructional resources available to reading teachers, and the teachers’ reading proficiency.

Parenting interventions

Early parenting interventions that improve the home literacy environment and co-opt parents to support implicit learning have shown promise. Community- and home-based reading activities that increase access to reading materials for children in and out of school are important.
Girls clubs

Girls’ clubs have become an increasingly common component of school-based and community-based programs that aim to improve outcomes and wellbeing of adolescent girls in developing countries. In 2017, the Gender and Adolescence Global Evidence (GAGE) consortium undertook a rigorous review of 63 studies on the empowerment impacts of 44 girls’ or youth development clubs and gender-equality-focused life skills programs. The review, the first of its kind to synthesize existing evaluations of girls’ clubs, found that girls’ clubs and school life skills programs appeared to have positive impacts on girls’ self-confidence and self-efficacy, their levels of knowledge of key issues (such as how bodies work and women’s and girls’ legal rights), and on their attitudes to gender equality.

The GAGE review found that only eight studies examined whether these programs have led to lasting changes and found mixed evidence: attitude changes persisted in some but not others; knowledge gains appeared to have been sustained; economic empowerment gains (such as increased incomes or use of vocational skills learnt) appeared to be more durable, but there were too few studies to draw firm conclusions, and no studies examined whether girls had sustained gains in self-confidence or self-efficacy.
LIVELIHOODS
CURRENT STATE OF LIVELIHOODS IN ETHIOPIA

For millions coming of age in the mid-1980s, Ethiopia was synonymous with poverty, failed state, and famine. Efforts mobilized in the West in response were meant to bring to bear the wealth and ingenuity of more developed countries to, once and for all, rid Ethiopia of what appeared to be chronic poverty.

Importantly, Ethiopia has experienced significant gains across a range of livelihoods indicators since the 1980s: from a low of $515 in 1990, the country has more than tripled its GDP/capita to $1608 in 2016; the percentage of its population living below the national poverty line has fallen by nearly one-third, from 45.5 percent to 30 percent; life expectancy at birth has increased dramatically, from a low of 43 years during the worst of the famine, to 65.5 years today.

Still, Ethiopia remains among the world’s very poorest countries, with 53 percent of its population reported as multidimensionally poor, and 67 percent reported as being at or near multidimensionally poor (UNDP, 2016). It is the 11th poorest country in terms of undernourishment, and it is in the bottom third among countries with regards to renewable internal freshwater per capita.

Agriculture

Multiple strategies to improve well-being have been pursued in Ethiopia, with varying degrees of success. With regards to agriculture-based strategies, Alemu et al (2011) find that family size, land and livestock holdings, diversification in crop production, engagement in non-farm activities, and utilization of microfinance services are related to improvements in household welfare. Similarly, Dorash and Mellor (2013) point to agricultural strategies as important for increasing employment and accelerating poverty reduction in Ethiopia. They qualify this finding, however, by noting successful agricultural strategies “will require the engagement of small commercial farmers, large enough to adopt new technologies and produce significant marketed surpluses, but small and numerous enough to have spending patterns that drive a large, vibrant rural non-farm sector.” Headey et al (2014) look at vulnerability of agricultural strategies to drought, calling for diversification into both sedentary and non-farm strategies, with education forming the central pillar in these diversification strategies.

Small business development

Another commonly pursued strategy to improve well-being is support for small business development. Anguko et al’s (2015) evaluation of Oxfam GB’s project to link smallholder coffee producers to sustainable markets found positive impacts across a range of indicators, including revenue and asset wealth. Loison (2015) also finds a positive relationship between livelihood diversification among rural smallholders and well-being, but she notes that this benefit is not uniform; varying by the level of asset ownership.

Irrigation

Irrigation projects have been crucial to both agriculture and small business development in Ethiopia. In her largely qualitative study, Yami (2015) finds that governance capacity and accountability are key challenges for sustaining irrigation projects. She identifies the need for more equitable access to irrigation projects, active engagement of the local community in their planning, and long-term capacity building regarding local governance as potential solutions to these challenges. Bacha et al’s study (2011) of the poverty impacts of small-scale irrigation in Ethiopia finds that the incidence of poverty is significantly lower among those farming households...
with access to irrigation.

While not intractable, poverty, particularly non-income-based, multidimensional poverty, in Ethiopia is certainly stubborn. NGO-based efforts to reduce poverty and improve well-being will, of course, need to bear in mind the country’s long history of vulnerability to various shocks that serve to keep the vast bulk of the population mired in poverty traps.

**CURRENT GLIMMER STRATEGY**

Glimmer’s livelihoods strategy is to maximize the agricultural and small business potential of its program areas, resulting in increased food production and household assets, a more reliable family income, improved food security and better nutrition throughout the year. Glimmer’s livelihoods strategy consists of four components:

- **Irrigation**: Check dams and river diversions channel and control surface water, enabling year-round crop production for hundreds of farmers. Increased crop harvests result in improved household food consumption and nutrition, and produce cash crops for sale in the markets, which increases the nutrition of the community.

- **Animal care**: Veterinary clinics provide critical animal care like immunizations and disease treatment, which reduce animal deaths. Farm animals are highly valuable assets, comprising a family’s wealth and resilience. Access to animal health care protects farmers’ valuable assets.

- **Loans and training for agricultural production**: Loans and training provide residents with opportunities to increase their farming activities. See below for more information.

- **Loans and training for small business activities**: Loans and training provide vulnerable populations like landless youth and female-headed households with small business opportunities, creating jobs and income.

Glimmer conducts a detailed assessment of the existing veterinary care and needs, and the potential for irrigation, during the planning phase of the program. Glimmer creates a custom plan for the specific loans and trainings to conduct in each program area based on their unique needs and opportunities. Glimmer hires a third-party consultant who conducts a value chain assessment during the planning phase to identify the livelihoods activities with the highest potential for growth and sustainability in the area.

**CURRENT LIVELIHOODS INTERVENTIONS**

**Food Security Program**

The Government of Ethiopia’s central program for coordinating and implementing livelihood initiatives is the Food Security Program (FSP). Launched in 2003, the FSP comprises four major different components for helping and strengthening rural communities living in tenuous conditions: the Resettlement Programme, Complementary Community Investment (CCI), the Household Asset Building Programme (HABP), and the Productive Safety Net Programme (PSNP). The Resettlement Programme resettles households from difficult environments to areas with greater land and water availability and supplies them with basic tools, food rations, credit to purchase livestock, and basic services to help them in their new location. The CCI invests in infrastructure and assets at the community level in food-insecure woredas, while the HABP

---

1 A value chain encompasses the full range of activities and services required to bring a product or service from production to end consumer.
instead focuses on building up assets for poorer households so that they can better weather climatic shocks and escape poverty.

**Productive Safety Net Programme**

From a livelihoods standpoint, the key component of the Food Security Program is the Productive Safety Net Programme. The PSNP, currently in its fourth phase of operation, provides food and cash to extremely poor households, especially in the difficult months between June and August. The underlying intent behind the program is to help households deal with shocks so that they do not need to sell off productive assets and are instead better-equipped to exit extreme poverty once the period of food insecurity is past. This is coupled with a public works component, in which participants work on public projects, which are typically concerned with improving local environmental sustainability. Households with limited labor endowments, such as those with disabled or elderly members, instead receive more direct assistance. In the most recent fourth phase, which is planned for 2015 to 2020, individual coaching and training are offered to all interested participants, and access to credit is provided in addition to cash transfers, in the hope that this will prevent aid recipients from becoming dependent on the program. The training and coaching can be on life skills, saving behavior, crop and livestock management, or technical and vocational education for finding off-farm employment. The PSNP is in implementation across Ethiopia, and there are several smaller pilots being monitored that may be scaled up in the next phase of the program.

**United Kingdom’s Department for International Development**

In addition to funding components of the Food Security Program, the United Kingdom’s Department for International Development (DFID) is in the process of launching its Building Resilience in Ethiopia (BRE) program to support sustainable livelihoods. BRE is planned to run 41 months beginning in December 2018 and will focus on both addressing short-term needs during humanitarian emergencies and strengthening the Government of Ethiopia’s capacity to respond to future shocks. BRE will have an aid component, delivering cash and food, and will provide technical assistance and monitoring and evaluation services to help develop more effective livelihood support strategies. The intent behind this program is to ensure that the Government will be well-situated to take over and operate these services in the coming years so that the UK’s humanitarian agency footprint can be reduced.

**The United States Agency for International Development (USAID)**

The United States Agency for International Development (USAID) is involved with several large-scale initiatives in Ethiopia related to food security and livelihoods. The Feed the Future Initiative, which is active in several developing countries, has pilots and projects in Ethiopia, dealing with crop development, agricultural productivity and land capacity, and bolstering market chains and entrepreneurship. Among their many projects in Ethiopia are:

- Better Potato for a Better Life and the Smallholder Horticulture Project, which both seek to improve the quality and reliability of Ethiopian crop production and create better market pathways for farmers to increase their income;
- Agriculture Growth Program – Livestock Market Development, which invests in livestock value chains;
- the Agriculture Knowledge, Learning, Documentation and Policy Project, which gathers successes from Feed the Future initiatives and
tries to advocate for similar policies and scaling up future initiatives;

- the Environmental Entrepreneurship Program, which creates jobs for women and youth in four woredas related to managing the local environment; and

- the Feed the Future Ethiopia Farm Service Center Project, which has built 40 farm service centers to support 200,000 smallholding farms.

**World Bank Group**

The International Development Agency (IDA) of the World Bank Group invests largely in infrastructure projects and education in Ethiopia, but it also has initiatives that target livelihoods and poverty directly. In particular, the Women Entrepreneurship Development Project (WEDP) provides training and grants credit to women interested in starting their own small enterprises. The Project also works to improve existing Micro-Finance Institutions in Ethiopia so that women can more easily access credit for their small businesses. The Project has achieved a very high repayment rate (99.6% in 2014) and is beginning to grant larger loans, on the order of $10,000. Uptake of the business training has been on the low side, however, which may be due to attendance constraints that women face or that interest is lower than participants had expressed. The Government of Ethiopia has also run similar credit programs targeted to women, such as the Ethiopian Women Development Fund and the Women’s Development Initiatives Project, in the past.

**CARE**

CARE has been active in Ethiopia since 1984 and oversees several ongoing programs related to livelihood, water, and food security. Their focus has a strong gender component; the three populations they target are pastoralist girls, chronically food-insecure rural women, and poor girls in urban areas. CARE works to help pastoralist communities anticipate and manage drought cycles in the Mandera Triangle and provides emergency food relief and nutritional support to mothers and children in times of need. Their Graduating out of Social Assistance into Long-Term Food Security (GRAD) program ran from 2011 to 2016 and worked with 63,000 families across 16 regions to help them graduate and stay out of poverty. The program used a series of push interventions, such as training to encourage better savings behavior and greater agricultural productivity, and pull interventions, such as working with agro-dealers and local finance institutes to expand access to poorer farmers. CARE is currently scaling up this intervention approach with Livelihoods for Resilience Activity, which will apply a similar strategy to 98,000 households on the PSNP in 27 woredas in Amhara, SNNPR, and Tigray through to 2021.

**Oxfam**

Oxfam has several sustainable livelihood interventions in Ethiopia. At the moment, they are working to alleviate the effects of the drought in five regions – Fafan, Jarar, Dollo, Korahe, and Afder – by promoting more sustainable agricultural production and improve market access for women and marginalized groups. They are also bringing clean water and cash assistance to drought-affected parts of the Southern Somali region and offering veterinary treatment and vaccinations for livestock there. More broadly, they have been working to scale up agriculture in smallholder farms by developing high-value crops such as coffee, sesame, and soy and connecting farmers with reliable markets. Oxfam has a 15-year pastoral program in operation which focuses on long-term development related to education, health, and small business cooperatives in more remote rural regions.
ACDI/VOCA

ACDI/VOCA implements USDA’s three-year Feed Enhancement for Ethiopian Development (FEED) II project. The overall goal of FEED II is to increase the incomes of Ethiopian smallholder livestock producers by improving access to and use of consistent, affordable, high-quality animal feed that can support greater livestock and poultry productivity and efficiency. The project works in Amhara, Oromia, SNNPR and Tigray regions. To date, FEED II has established 12 commercial feed manufacturing enterprises, and it has continued to provide technical support to 13 enterprises that were created during FEED I. It works with 56 cooperative union staff and government experts on feed formulation and manufacturing. Resulting sales through March 2016 were valued at almost $4 million. FEED II has also trained 640 government extension agents and over 26,000 smallholder farmers (32% women) in sustainable forage production and on-farm feeding management and record keeping, and it administers nearly USD 3 million in grants to support feed sector input and service providers and establishment/expansion of small scale commercial forage, livestock, and poultry enterprises.

The Hunger Project

The Hunger Project’s Asgede Tsimbilal Development Program assists farmers in restoring and protecting environmentally degraded farmland through the provision of pruning equipment, rainwater-harvesting tanks, improved seeds, and construction materials for an irrigation canal.

The Volunteers for Economic Growth Alliance

The Volunteers for Economic Growth Alliance operates the Syndromic Surveillance for Livestock Health program. The program has four main livelihood-related goals:

- Improve nutrition for smallholder farmers by improving livestock animal health
- Increase awareness of trade-related and zoonotic diseases by creation of passive surveillance, or the routine reporting of the cases of diseases reaching health care facilities for treatment or service;
- Promote awareness and recognition of foreign animal diseases for US veterinarians;
- Support existing USDA and USAID commitments to regional disease control to advance trade.

Ultimately, it is hoped that improved livestock health will lead to improved food supply, nutrition, and economic growth.

World Vision

World Vision’s Durame Development Program supports livelihoods through 15 savings groups comprising 375 individuals. These savings groups assist families by creating interest-bearing savings accounts, and by providing small loans for business development. The program also provides vocational training in carpentry and masonry, distributes seeds, and equips healthcare providers with material needed at area healthcare centers.

World Vision’s Quacha Birra Development Program supports livelihood development through the establishment of savings groups for women that are able to provide small business loans as well as set up interest-bearing savings accounts. In addition, the program supports beekeepers’ training and a beekeepers’ cooperative. The program provides improved seed varieties to increase crop yields, supports water conservation efforts in order to support crop growth, and assists in crop diversification.
BEST PRACTICES FROM LITERATURE

Asset development

An often overlooked strategy for improving livelihoods is asset development. Throughout the development literature, assets are noted as essential to the success of other strategies (agriculture, animal care, small business development, etc.), but are relatively rarely thought of as the objective in and of themselves. The literature that does exist, however, finds that assets, to which value accrues over time, and that can be passed down from one generation to the next, are often the lynchpin in breaking the poverty cycle. In her seminal work, Moser (2007) categorizes assets by four types: physical, such as housing, land, vehicles; financial-productive, such as employment security, savings, etc.; human, in terms of education and skill development; and social, particularly connections with one’s community.

With regards to Ethiopia in particular, Alemu et al (2011) find that livelihood asset holdings, in terms of land and livestock were positively related to improved household welfare, and Dercon et al (2012) note that a lack of physical assets is associated with chronic poverty in Ethiopia. In their examination of poverty dynamics in rural Ethiopia, Liverpool-Tasie et al (2011) find that an asset-based measure could be used to more effectively target pro-poor interventions.

A review of the best practices literature suggests that asset development-related projects have achieved notable success in Ethiopia in recent years. These projects approach poverty reduction from a theoretical perspective similar to the one that Moser describes, understanding the persistence of poverty to be related to the lack of value-generating assets.

Graduation Approach

One such success in Ethiopia has been the Ford Foundation-supported “Graduation Approach”, noted above, adapted from BRAC-funded projects in Bangladesh.

The Graduation approach consists of six complementary components, each designed to address specific constraints facing ultra-poor households.

1. **Productive asset transfer**: One-time transfer of productive assets, such as cows, goats, or supplies for petty trade.

2. **Technical skills training**: Training to manage the productive asset.

3. **Consumption support**: Regular cash or food support for a few months to a year.

4. **Savings**: Access to a savings account, or encouragement to save.

5. **Home visits**: Frequent home visits by implementing partner staff to provide accountability, coaching, and encouragement.

6. **Health**: Health education, health care access, and/or life skills training.

These components are designed to be applied sequentially, with recipients “graduating” from one component to the next. The Ford Foundations impact evaluation of the Graduation Approach pilot programs in several developing countries found that program participants earned increased levels of income and achieved sustained gains in household consumption, assets, and food security at least one year after the two-year pilot programs ended. It is important to note that this particular asset-development strategy for improving livelihoods consists of multiple supportive strategies, rather than
a single asset-development intervention, designed to help ensure that the initial asset transfer can contribute to improvements in livelihoods.

**WE-RISE strategy**

Another asset-development livelihoods strategy that has demonstrated success in Ethiopia is CARE International’s Women’s Empowerment: Improving Resilience, Income, and Food Security (WE-RISE). WE-RISE is designed to improve the quality of life for chronically food insecure rural women by increasing agricultural productivity through income generating activities, supporting environments promoting women’s rights and gender-sensitive agricultural programming, and improving institutional capacity for gender-equitable programming. Per an evaluation of WE-RISE by TANGO International, “four years into the inception of WE RISE in Ethiopia, CARE and its implementing partner SOS Sahel have successfully achieved the goal – ‘Improved Food Security, Income, and Resilience for Chronically Food Insecure Rural Women through their social and economic empowerment’ – of this highly ambitious project. Designed, developed, and implemented within a highly patriarchal social-cultural context where women’s access to and control over productive assets and resources have been highly constricted, WE RISE has successfully if modestly undertaken and realized progress toward attaining the simultaneous empowerment of women economically and socially.” (Sutter, 2016).

**Other livelihood development strategies**

Other successful, evaluated, livelihood development strategies that are not explicitly focused on asset development include Oxfam GB’s “Coffee Value Chain – Linking Smallholders to a Sustainable and Scalable Business Model in Ethiopia”, which, upon evaluation, was found to have made positive improvements in the livelihoods of rural coffee producers stemming from increased quantities and higher revenue obtained. Also, agricultural advisory services (AASs) are regarded as a key component of economic development strategies in terms of improving productivity and livelihoods. In their quasi-experimental evaluation of AASs and Farmers’ Training Centers, Wordofa and Sassi (2017) find a significant average gain of annual farm income by participants of the training, ranging from Birr 9557 to Birr 10,388 per household.
RECOMMENDATIONS
Our objective in selecting these recommendations from among a host of other potentials is to aim at a root cause and to identify those interventions with maximum leverage to improve outcomes with regards to other poverty drivers.

**GENERAL**

1. **Commit to working in a reduced number of sites.**

Glimmer’s reach is remarkable for an NGO of its size, and the breadth of its investments reflects its solid understanding of the drivers of poverty in Ethiopia. However, it runs the risk of diminishing its impact by working across such a wide range of villages, across such a broad swath of the country, and across a variety of interventions. We recommend that Glimmer focus its investments in areas where it has had the longest presence. For example, it appears that Glimmer is in its third or fourth year of work in Shoa, where it has invested in health, education, livelihoods, and clean water projects. It may be the case that Glimmer has a similarly long presence in several other villages/districts where there is a critical mass of Glimmer-supported activity such that the benefits begin to feed into a virtuous cycle of self-perpetuating local support.

2. **Create 5- or 10-year strategic plans**

Consider 5- and 10-year investment plans, with the understanding that investment strategies will need to be re-evaluated at these intervals.

Related to the recommendation above is a recommendation that Glimmer adopt long-term strategic plans for a reduced number of sites. Based again on the Shoa example, it does appear that this is how Glimmer currently operates. Creating 5- or 10-year plans, in the context of a reduced number of target sites will provide a blueprint for change Glimmer wishes to see in a particular village/district, and may assist in fundraising activities as potential donors are able to envision transformative change contained within the longer term plans.

**EDUCATION**

Our review of the best practices literature, as well as of other education-based interventions suggests that Glimmer may achieve even greater impact were it to focus primarily on primary school education to improve early-grade literacy and numeracy and, where needed, building construction. Specifically, Glimmer may want to consider concentrating its education investments on the following activities:

3. **Teacher training in reading/math instruction**

Glimmer should continue to provide much-needed support for improving teacher training in reading and math instruction focused on early-grade literacy and numeracy. Per the 2017 annual review of General Education Quality Improvement Project (GEQIP) by DFID Ethiopia, assistance provided for women sitting for a training exam to become school principals is needed and would aid in addressing gender inequality among teachers and administration.

4. **Provide quality teaching and learning materials in the local language**

Glimmer should continue to support financially the purchase of quality teaching and learning materials, including audiobook readers, produced in the local language.

5. **Increased instructional time**

Glimmer may want to consider strategies that support increased instructional time for primary school students, including, possibly, extending the school day, or the school year.

6. **Building construction**
Despite a large number of actors in the Ethiopian educational field, the number of schools in the country is far below that demanded. Glimmer should continue to invest in educational infrastructure.

**LIVELIHOODS**

Our livelihoods-related recommendations combine elements of an asset-based approach with the more traditional sustainable livelihoods based approach. The recommendations are asset-based in that we are calling for interventions that are specifically designed to increase asset holdings (livestock or savings generated from the sale of livestock or crops); they are livelihoods-based in that they encourage a sharper focus on water supply as a means to an end, i.e., helping to ensure asset development.

7. **Limit your investment strategies to a relatively small set of manageable, highly integrated, and complementary place-based livelihoods investments.**

In addition to narrowing the focus on a specific set of sites, and clearly defining 5- and/or 10-year plans, we recommend limiting investment strategies to a set of mutually-reinforcing livelihoods strategies. While the specifics of these strategies will necessarily differ by place, one approach could be modeled on USAID’s “farm service centers” noted above. For example, and based on the best practices literature, Glimmer could consider a 5-year plan to increase livelihoods resilience through (a.) establishing/strengthening farming cooperatives; (b.) diversifying crops and/or livestock holdings; and (c.) ensuring that these strategies are explicitly designed to increase asset holdings among women.

8. **Consider focusing primarily, although not exclusively, on increasing water supply and improving water quality.**

As noted at the outset of this section, and as reflected in the literature, the factors driving poverty in Ethiopia are multiple and varied. However, if there is a lynchpin connecting most of these factors, it is likely the scarcity of water. Whether having to do with crops or livestock, never mind general health, lack of reliable access to water for productive purposes and consumption acts as a brake on nearly any conceivable livelihoods strategy that one might pursue in Ethiopia.

A focus on increasing water supply and improving water quality may also serve as a foundation upon which other development interventions could be established, including farm service centers described above. Depending on the agroclimatic environment in which Glimmer is working, different water-based strategies would apply; from soil moisture management in relatively wetter climates, to small-scale irrigation projects, to improving access to water for livestock in drier climates.

A water-based livelihoods approach could be developed to complement government-supported strategies currently being implemented, and Glimmer’s long history on the ground in Ethiopia gives it access to valuable grassroots, participatory-generated knowledge of how best to design interventions. Moreover, Glimmer’s reputation will permit it to establish strategic partnerships among other NGOs who may be able to bring complementary programs to address other contributors to poverty that fall outside of Glimmer’s primary foci.

Combining an investment strategy built around improving access to water with a strategy to improve agriculture-related inputs, such as farmers coops or farm service centers, focused in a few target areas of the country, guided by a multi-year plan, would help to ensure that Glimmer’s livelihoods interventions produce maximal impact.
9. Explicitly adopt an asset-development approach

Towards Glimmer’s goal to increase livelihoods via improved irrigation structures (as well as its goal to improve health via ensuring access to clean water), asset-development approaches built upon managing water resources have shown some success.

CHF International (now Global Communities), for example, implemented its “Asset Building Group” (ABG) approach in multiple communities throughout Ethiopia as part of its “Sustainable Humanitarian Assistance Program for Ethiopia” from 2006-2011. The program goal was to provide groups of households with a productive asset that could be used to stabilize incomes, as well as provide a basis for income generation over time (Wilcox and Gray, 2012).

One region in particular, the Somali Region, provides useful lessons for an approach to asset-development that could combine several of the best practices described above. Specifically, CHF organized ABGs among former pastoralist families now farming individual plots of land, providing each group with a water pump for irrigation. This contrasted with the more traditional approach of renting a pump from a single owner, who often neglected to maintain the pumps or properly fuel them. The introduction of a communal pump into the ABG made the ABG responsible for maintenance, but also permitted the ABG members to devote a portion of their increased income (resulting from improved agricultural sales) to a pump maintenance fund. The increased income accruing to ABG members led, in some cases, to diversification of income sources among some members. For example, some ABGs used their increased income to purchase additional pumps, thereby increasing their irrigation and crop-growing capacity, while other individual members bought their own pumps to rent out, which not only generated income for the pump owner, but also increased the group’s irrigation capacity (Wilcox and Gray, 2012).
REFERENCES


“Education” USAID Ethiopia,
https://www.usaid.gov/ethiopia/education


ODI. 2016. To What Extent is the Productive Safety Net Programme (PSNP) Making a Difference? United Kingdom


